



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

*Scott Haggerty, Chair*  
Alameda County

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Chu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Chris Daly*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Amy Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director,  
Bay Area Toll Authority

*Therese W. McMillan*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
MEETING OF OCTOBER 9, 2009  
MINUTES**

**ATTENDANCE**

Commissioner Spering called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Azumbrado, Chu, Giacopini, Haggerty, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, and Tissier. Commissioners Bates, and Cortese also attended.

**CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of September 11, 2009**

Commissioner Azumbrado requested a correction be made to the minutes. He stated that the minutes incorrectly reflect his concern about emphasizing accessibility of townhouses; and requested the following change: "Commissioner Azumbrado expressed his concerns about emphasizing townhouses as a means to promote accessibility."

Commissioner Tissier moved approval of the minutes as amended by request of Commissioner Azumbrado, Commissioner Lempert seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**TOD Choice Study**

Ms. Valerie Knepper stated that this effort is intended to better understand what people are looking for in their choice of housing so that we can create TODs that are attractive to more people. The study included focus groups, surveys of over 900 households in the Bay Area who have recently moved or plan to move soon, input by a Technical Advisory Committee, and policy review by local practitioners.

Ms. Knepper introduced Mr. Chris Wornum of Cambridge Systematics who touched upon six key attitudes that shape the neighborhood choice. He noted that almost all of the segments cared greatly about walkability – about being able to walk safely at night and to walk or bike to errands in their neighborhood. He described the 8 market segments based on these attitudes. He went on to describe the three step process for using this information by local jurisdictions – by evaluating an individual TOD on these characteristics using suggested or other metrics, identifying market segments attracted to a particular TOD, and implementing strategies to improve the attractiveness of the TOD.

Commissioner Cortese asked if this effort was intended to be used to support TOD projects that are catering to people to get them to urban centers or is it how many people want to get into San Francisco? Mr. Steve Heminger stated that this survey is not designed to give the level of local detail the commissioners may be looking for. If this is of interest, then staff could recommend additional scope to develop more detailed information. Commissioner Mackenzie stated that Sonoma County would be interested in more detailed information.

Commissioner Lempert commented on parking management and asked if it would have made a difference with people whether parking fees were charged separate from housing payments, which is critical for the city and the developers to know as they plan their TODs.

Commissioner Rubin asked about arrangements for people who are availing themselves for affordable housing, but also want parking. Mr. Wornum stated that individuals who want affordable housing and parking may need to be willing to trade off something to make parking affordable. He added that the research did show that some market segments are prepared to live among a more diverse set of income households, but they want their parking. Charging a market rate for parking makes the development worthwhile to build for the developer, but also makes affordable housing requirements more achievable.

Commissioner Azumbrado suggested that staff look into the acceptability of rentals to current home owners. Mr. Wornum stated that there is a lot of research being done by private industry that could help answer this question.

Commissioner Chu suggested that the report refer “city center access such as San Francisco or other job centers”.

Commissioner Sperling stated that it is important to understand whether the person who is going to use transit is also the person who will live in a TOD. Staff needs to be careful that the TODs are not filled up with people who don’t use transit. He also suggested that more are likely to use transit if there is limited parking in TODs.

Ms. Knepper stated that this study will be presented to the Advisory Council, the Minority Citizens Advisory committee, and the national Rail~Volution Conference, and that the print version of Briefing Book will be ready in about one month; copies will be provided to the Commissioners and other interested people, and the briefing Book and technical papers will be made available on MTC’s web site.

Commissioner Sperling called for public comment.

- Marshall Loring, MTC EDAC, stated that staff needs to look at the sum of commute plus housing costs, which seems to be a major factor in a number of cases in people’s choice on where they want to live.
- Craig Yates, Golden Gate Transit Citizens Advisory Committee and MTC EDAC, stated that TOD should be for low-income, 100% accessible in all manner, not have parking, promote use of public transit, and are coordinated with housing authorities.

#### **OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 10:25 a.m. The Committee’s next meeting is scheduled for Friday, November 13, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.

*Planning Committee Minutes – July 10, 2009*  
*Page 3*

J:\COMMITTEE\Planning Committee\2009\November09\1\_minutes.doc